THE NARRATION OF HADHRAT ABDULLAAH IBN MAS`OOD (radhiAllaahu anhu)

We have previously cited the narration wherein Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) had expelled a group of people from the Musjid, who were busy making Zikr aloud. One of them was making the others read 100 times each of Takbeer, Tahleel and Tasbeeh. When Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) heard of these people, he called it an innovation and a Bid`a, and he expressed displeasure at this act of theirs.

Some people have now said that this narration is not authentic and they claim that those who are anti-loud Zikr are using this narration as a weapon in their favour whereas Umar Bin Yahya is one of the narrators, who is weak and unreliable (according to the terminology of the Muhadditheen). He has been compared to Shu`ba (another narrator), who is claimed to narrate weak Ahaadith. Besides this narration being 'weak' (it is claimed), it also conflicts with Usool-e-Deen and all the Ulama-e-Muhaqqiqeen have rejected it. In this regard Allama Aaloosi (rahmatullahi alaih) states that the narration of Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) is regarded as incorrect according to the Ulama and Huffaaz of Hadith. As far as its authenticity is concerned (they say), it conflicts with those narrations where it is reported that Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) himself made Zikr in a loud voice. This has been reported from numerous Huffaaz of Ahaadith. Otherwise, (they aver) his prohibition was for that loud Zikr which was excessive (in loudness). (They also claim that) Imaam Suyooti (rahmatullahi alaih) has written that this narration, as far as its correctness and authenticity is concerned, conflicts with the numerous Ahaadith of Rasulullaah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam), wherein the permissibility of loud Zikr has been established. (They also aver that) Allaamah Ismail Haqqa Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaih) mentions with regard to this narration that he noted in the answer to this narration of Shaikh Sambal Khalwati (rahmatullahi alaih) that this narration of Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) is a lie and fabrication leveled against this great Sahaabi, because this narration conflicts with the texts of the Qur`aan Shareef, Ahaadith and the actions of the Angels.

OUR REPLY

The people who have written the above have done so due to their ignorance and little understanding.
Firstly, the narrator that they have indicated is definitely not the one reported in Daarmi. The Sanad (chain of narrators) as reported in Daarmi is as follows:
Al-Hakam Bin Mubarak has reported from Amar Bin Yahya who said: 'I heard my father report from his father….."

The person they have cited as the narrator of this Hadith (Umar Bin Yahya) has neither reported from his father Yahya nor from his grandfather. Neither is any narration of his reported from Al-Hakam Bin Mubarak.
The narrator here is AMAR Bin Yahya Bin Saeed, who reports from his father and grandfather.
Imaam Ibn Hibbaan has verified him as being reliable. Imaam Ibn Mu`een and Imaam Daar-e-Qutni have also reported him as being reliable.
In the authentic prints of the Kitaabs wherein this narration is reported, - like Musnad Daarmi, published in Kaanpur, page 38, and Musnad Daarmi (Urdu Translation) published in Delhi, it is clearly stated that the narrator is AMAR Bin Yahya. In some of the Arabic prints of this has been omitted, thus making the name Amar to read as Umar.
Secondly, Allama Aaloosi has not made any objection upon the narration of Hadhrat Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) as some people have claimed in their ignorance. If he had intended to make an objection upon the narration in Musnad-e-Daarmi and reject it, then he would have clearly stated so, since Musnad-e-Daarmi is a famous Hadith Kitaab.

Regarding the statements of Allama Aaloosi (rahmatullahi alaih), he had made the following points. Firstly that according to the Aimma-e-Huffaz Muhadditheen this narration is not authentic, but he has not cited any proof and clear reason for his claim. He has also not named these Huffaz-e-Muhadditheen. The objectors to this narration could be the likes of Imaam Khatieb Baghdaadi and Imaam Jozi, and other such staunch persons who regard as weak even Saheeh, authentic and 'Hasan' Ahaadith.

On the other hand, Imaam Bazaazi Hanafi and Allama Shaami (rahmatullahi alaihima) have authenticated this narration of Hadhrat Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu). [Fataawa Bazaazazia, vol.3, page 375 and Shaami, page 350, vol.5]

The general rule is "Al-Muthbit Awla Minan Naafi" (positive takes preference over negative). Imaam Aaloosi's (rahmatullahi alaih) claim regarding the unauthenticity of Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood's (radhiAllaahu anhu) narration is wanting of positive proof and reference of the names of the Huffaaz-e-Hadith that have rejected this narration. He should mention where and who have rejected this narration.

Imaam Suyooti (rahmatullahi alaih) has mentioned from the Kitaab, "Az-Zuhd", of Imaam Ibn Hambal (rahmatullahi alaih) who in turn reports from Hadhrat Abu Waa`il that people think Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) prevented people from making Zikr, whereas, he says that he never sat in any Majlis of Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) where he did not make Zikrullah in it. To draw conclusion and proof from this is incorrect because in this narration there is no mention of loud Zikr. Nobody denies or is opposed to Zikr itself. The people who cite this narration and have the words 'loud' between brackets indicate that these words are theirs and not actually in the narration.

In conclusion, it is clear that this narration of Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) is NOT conflicting with any other narration of his, nor of any other Sahaabi, nor any Marfoo` or Sareeh Hadith, as Imaam Suyooti has written. Neither is this narration a lie or fabrication. This narration is NOT weak or unreliable, in fact it falls in the category of being authentic, reliable and it has been authenticated by reliable persons.
Allama Aaloosi (rahmatullahi alaih) has also written that very loud Zikr is meant in this narration. This then is precisely what we have been saying. That loud Zikr which would awaken a sleeping person or disturb a person who is performing Salaat etc. is the one that is forbidden. A just person must view this matter, in the present times with objectivity and take note as to how the Ahle Bid`a make their Salaat and Salaam, and how other proponents of loud Zikr carry out their programs of Zikr in the Musaajid. Can all this be classified under loud Zikr or not? Does such type of loud Zikr not disturb the sleeping ones or those performing Salaat or not?

The reader can judge for himself with regard to what is right and correct in this matter.

Sheikh ul Hadith - Moulana Mohammad Sarfraaz Khan in "Akhfa-uz Zikr".

MOULANA ABDUL HAY LUKHNOWI'S VIEW ON LOUD ZIKR

Moulana Abdul Hay Saheb Lukhnowi (rahmatullahi alaih) summarises Loud Zikr in the following way:

(Imaam Baihaqi (rahmatullahi alaih) reports in his Kitaab "Sha`bul Imaan" from Hadhrat Sa`ad Bin Maalik (radhiAllaahu anhu) that Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: 'The best Zikr is that one which is recited softly and quietly and the best sustenance is that one which is sufficient.' It is reported in the commentary of Hidaya, "An-Nihaya", that it is Mustahab according to us (Hanafis) that Zikr be soft and quiet, except of course at those times when the Shariah desires it loud, like the Azaan and the Talbiyah of Hajj. Many Ahnaaf, amongst them the author of Hidaya, emphasies the point that to make Zikr in a loud voice is Bid`a. Zikr is actually meant to be soft. In conclusion, although Zikr in a loud voice is permissible, it is forbidden for it to be in excessive loudness. Soft Zikr is even better than a low pitch of loud Zikr. Why should it not be better since loud Zikr has many pitfalls. One of them is that it disturbs the sleeping persons, it also causes a disturbance in the concentration of those performing Salaat and makes them forget what they are reading and thirdly it is opposed to sincerity and concentration. Besides these there are many other evils. If you wish to know more (about this subject) then refer to my Kitaab, "Sabaahatul Fikr Bil Jahr Biz Zikr"".) [Majmoo` Fataawa vol.2, page 302 – Lukhnowi Print]

It is established from this text of Moulana Abdul Hay Lukhnowi (rahmatullahi alaih) that he is in no way in favour of loud Zikr. The Zikr that is being carried out nowadays through the loudspeakers, if this is not excessive Loud Zikr, then what else can it be? Moulana Saheb has also emphasised that soft Zikr is better than the (permissible form of) Loud Zikr. He has also outlined the numerous harms in excessive Loud Zikr, amongst them is the disturbance it causes to those performing Salaat. No level minded person can refute this fact that the Loud Zikr which is being carried out nowadays through the loudspeakers, not only cause disturbance to the people in the Musjid it self, but also to the surrounding areas and homes and it also disturbs the womenfolk at home who are reading their Salaat.
People must now understand the viewpoint of Hadhrat Moulana Abdul Hay Lukhnowi Saheb (rahmatullahi alaih). He is being quoted out of context and misunderstood. May Allah Ta`ala grant us all the Tawfeeq and understanding to accept and follow the Haqq. Aameen

RAISING THE VOICES IN THE MASAAJID

No Muslim is unaware of the respect and honour, which the Shariah has prescribed regarding the etiquettes of the Masaajid. It is proven in the Shariah that it is permissible to raise the voice in the Musjid for Azaan, Iqaamat, lectures, advices, loud Salaats (and also those Zikrs which are proven from the Shariah). Only that person who has no affiliation to the Shariah will deny this. The raising of the voices in the Masaajid, for any other reason, other than those which are proven from the Shariah, is contrary to the principles of Deen, hence impermissible.
Hadhrat Saa`ib bin Yazid (radhiAllaahu anhu) says that once he was sitting in Masjid-e-Nabawi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) when someone threw a few pebbles in his direction. When he looked up he saw that it was Hadhrat Umar (radhiAllaahu anhu), who told him to summon certain two persons to appear before him. When the two were brought in his presence, they were asked to which tribe and family they belonged. (The narrator doubts, and says that they were probably asked from where they came). They said that they were inhabitants of Taa`if. Hadhrat Umar (radhiAllaahu anhu) told them that if they were from Madinah Tayyibah, then he would have punished them, because:
"You raised your voices in the Masjid of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam)." [Bukhari Shareef, page 67, vol.1]

Undoubtedly, the raising of the voices in Masjid-e-Nabawi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) is forbidden. Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) is resting in his grave, and he (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) hears the Salaat and Salaam which is rendered upon him at his grave-side. Hence the Aayat : "Do not raise your voices above that of the Nabi.." will also apply in his Masjid, because it causes a disturbance to Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam). Therefore, it is apparent that to raise the voices in Masjid-e-Nabawi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) is strictly forbidden. However, in the above narration, Hadhrat Umar (radhiAllaahu anhu) has stated "Masjid" as the contributory factor for his prohibition of raising the voice. The Ahle-Ilm (Learned Scholars) are not oblivious of this fact that one ruling can be based upon numerous contributory factors.

Hadhrat Nu`maan bin Basheer (radhiAllaahu anhu) states that he was once sitting close to the Mimbar of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam), when a person commented: "I do not worry if I do not do any other work, after my acceptance of Islaam, other than giving water to the Haajis."
Another person said: "I do not worry, if I do no other work, other than contributing to the construction and service of Masjid-e-Haraam."
A third person said: "Jihaad in the path of Allaah Ta`ala far supercedes, that which you have mentioned."
Hadhrat Umar (radhiAllaahu anhu), who was also nearby, said:
"Do not raise your voices at the Mimbar of Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam)." [Muslim, page 134, vol.2]

Hadhrat Imaam Nawawi (rahmatullahi alaih) commented, the following on this narration:
"This narration proves that it is Makrooh to raise the voices in the Masaajid, on the day of Jum`ua and other days. This is also proven that when people have gathered for Salaat, then at such a time it is reprehensible to raise the voice even for beneficial (Ilmi) speech, because this will disturb those who are performing Salaat and Zikr. And Allaah Ta`ala Alone knows best." [Muslim, page 134, vol.2]

This much is proven from the commentary of Imaam Nawawi (rahmatullahi alaih) that to raise the voices, be it for the reason of beneficial talk or Zikr, in any Masjid is forbidden. He attaches the following condition of "...when people have gathered for Salaat..". He further explains that this raising of the voices in such situations will cause a disturbance to those performing Salaat.
It is for this reason that those who carry out their Zikrs and daily prescribed recitations, inevitably show little consideration (to others), hence this practice in the Masaajid is strictly forbidden. The explanation to the following objection will, Insha-Allaah Ta`ala, be given later: "Since loud Zikr causes a disturbance to the Musallees, why are lessons (and lectures) given at such times?"

Hadhrat Abu Huraira and Ali (radhiAllaahu anhuma) narrate a Hadith wherein Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) mentioned 15 signs of Qiyaamah, and he (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said that they (these signs) will surely transpire. One of these signs are:

“Voices will be raised in the Masaajid.” [Mishkaat Shareef, page 470, vol.2 - from Tirmidhi, page 44, vol.2]

Regarding this Hadith, Mullah Ali Qaari Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 1014A.H. - gave the following commentary:
“ Some of our Ulama have clearly stated that to raise the voice in the Musjid is HARAAM, even if it is for Zikr.” [Mirqaat, page 171, vo.1 - Multaan print]

From this it is clear that some of the Hanafi Ulama have ruled the raising of the voices in the Masaajid, even for Zikr, as being Haraam.
Allaamah Ala`ud Deen Muhammed bin Ali Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1088 A.H.), writes the following under the Aadaab (etiquettes) of the Musjid:

“To ask (for something) in the Musjid is HARAAM, and to give (something) is Makrooh. Similarly, to look for a lost item in the Musjid (is Makrooh). To recite poems in the Musjid is also Makrooh, unless they are for advice. Similarly, to recite loud Zikr in the Musjid is HARAAM, except for those who are seeking Ilm or Fiqh (i.e. for students of Deen, if they are learning in the Musjid).” [Durrul Mukhtaar with the Sharah Raddul Mukhtaar, page 617, vol.1, Misr print]

This text also proves that it is Makrooh to raise the voices in the Masaajid, even for Zikr. Allaamah Halbi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaih) writes in “Ghuniatul Mustamil”, under “Ahkaamul Masjid”:
“It is Waajib to save the Masjid from foul odours...................(similarly it is also necessary to save the Masjid from) the raising of voices and arguments.” Thereafter, he quotes the following Hadith on the authority of Musannif Abdur Razzaaq:

Hadhrat Ma`az bin Jabal (radhiAllaahu anhu) reported that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: “Keep your children and your insane persons away from the Masaajid, also (keep) your buying, selling, quarrels and RAISED VOICES (away from the Masaajid).” [Al-Kabeeri, page 566-7 - Musannif Abdur Razzaaq, page 442, vol.1 - Beirut print]

This Hadith also proves that Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) prohibited the raising of the voices in the Masaajid. Here is meant that speech which is unnecessary and without reason.

Allaamah Sayyid Mahmood Aaloosi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) -passed away 1270 A.H.- mentioned the following regarding loud Zikr:

“You see many persons, in your era, who yell when they make du`aa, especially in gatherings (in the Masaajid), to such an extent that they make them (du`aas) poetic. They holler to such an extent that ears even get clogged. They are (blissfully) unaware that they have perpetrated two (2) Bid`as. One is to raise the voice in du`aa, and the other is to raise the voice in the Musjid.” [Roohul Ma`aani, page 139, vol.8]

This statement of Allaamah Aaloosi (rahmatullahi alaihi) was made about 150 years ago. We assume that during that era there were no loudspeakers; if he had to be present today to see our present situations, Allah Ta`ala knows best what would have been his reaction !

Haafiz Ibn Taymia Hanbali (rahmatullahi alaihi) -passed away 728 A.H. - writes:

“It is forbidden to raise the voice in the Masjid; it is especially worse to do so in Musjid-e-Nabawi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam).” [Manaasikul Hajj, page 36 - Misr print]

Generally, Zikr is made loudly in the Masaajid for name and fame, and to bolster one=s own faction (sect), and to degrade persons of other beliefs. Imaam Ebrahim bin Moosa Shaatbi Maaliki (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 790 A.H. - said in complaint of the same:
“However, to raise the voices in the Masaajid, which is done to highlight altercations in Deen, is a Bid`a..” [ Al-I`tisaam, page 79, vol.2 - Misr print]

According to this reference from Imaam Shaatbi (rahmatullahi alaih) it refers specifically to those who have adopted this form of making Zikr and du`aa in a screaming

mode, not out of attachment to Allaah Ta`ala, but purely out of causing friction and fighting (with other factions). May Allaah Ta`ala out of His Special Mercy and Grace save all Muslims, who have sincere faith, from all types of Bid`ahs, and may He give others the Tawfeeq (Guidance) to tread the "Siraatul Mustaqeem"

Imaam Haafizud Deen Muhammed bin Muhammed Bazazi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 827 A.H. - writes:
"It is stated in Fataawa Qadhi Khaan, that to raise the voice in Zikr in the Masjid is HARAAM. The following incident is authentically reported from Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu), that he heard some people who were gathered in the Musjid reciting Laa Ilaaha Illallahu and Durood Shareef loudly. Hadhrat Abdullah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) went to them and said: "We did not witness such an act during the time of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam), and I regard you as Bid`atees." He repeated this again and again until he ejected them from the Masjid." [Fataawa Bazazia, page 375, vol.3]

From this we learn that to raise the voice in the Masjid in Zikr or Durood Shareef is BID`A according to Hadhrat Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu). He ejected a group who were reciting Zikr and Durood loudly in the Masjid and he labelled them Bid`atees. Regarding the high status and rank enjoyed by Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) over the other Sahabah in so far as Tafseer, Fiqh and knowledge is concerned, is as clear as daylight. Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) once said: "That thing which Ibn Mas`ood prefers for you, I too prefer the same for you and I am pleased with it." [Mustadrak, page 319, vol.3]

It appears in another narration that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: "That thing which Ibn Mas`ood prefers for my Ummat, I am pleased with it." (Mustadrak, page 317, vol.3]

Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) also said: "That thing which Abdullah ibn Mas`ood does not approve of, I too disapprove of that thing for you." [Al-Isti`aab, page 359, vol.1]
It is evidently clear how much Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) had placed his trust and confidence in Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu).

Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) gives the following golden advices, which is recorded in Mishkaat Shareef:

"Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) said : 'If any of you wish to follow in the footsteps of someone, then you should follow in the footsteps of those pious persons who had already passed away, because there is no guarantee that a living person will not fall into Fitnah. Those persons (who you should follow) are the companions of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam). They are the best of this Ummat. Their hearts were pure and they were very deep in knowledge. They were extremely forthright. Allah Ta`ala had specially chosen them for the companionship of His Nabi. They were appointed for the establishment of this Deen. You should recognise their virtue and follow in their footsteps. Hold on firmly, upon whatever you have the ability to, from their character and habits, because surely they were guided aright. Narrated by Razeen" [Mishkaat, page 32, vol.1]

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) stated in the commentary of this Hadith that the Sahabah (radhiAllaahu anhum) never recited Zikr and Durood Shareef, in loud voices. They also never gathered for this purpose in the Masjid or in their homes. [Mirqaat, page 214, vol.1]

An renowned Aalim of the Barelwis, Molvi Abdus Samee` Saheb has also conceded to the above mentioned narration. He states:
"It is reported in "Hamawi ", "It appears in "Fataawa Qadhi" that loud Zikr is Haraam. It is reliably reported from Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) that he heard group of people who were gathered in the Masjid, reading "Laa Ilaaha Illallahu" and Durood loudly. He went to them and said: "We have not witnessed this in the era of Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam). I do not perceive you except as Bid`atees." He continued saying this until he expelled them from the Masjid."
It can be seen from this narration that Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) did not (only) object to their new form (of Zikr), in fact he expelled them from the Masjid, due to the fact that to make loud Zikr is contrary to the Sunnat of Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam). We are saying the same thing that to innovate something contrary to the order of the Shariah is forbidden." ["Anwaar Saati`a", pages 38/39].

This is the ruling of a Barelwi Aalim, now take note of the ruling of two prominent Deobandis:
Moulana Sayyid Muhammed Anwar Shah Kashmeeri (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 1352 A.H.- avers that to raise the voice in Zikr in the Masjid is HARAAM. He

states this, by quoting Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi). [Urfush Shazi, page 120]

Moulana Muhammed Yusuf Binori (rahmatullahi alaihi) also clearly mentions the prohibition of raising the voice in Zikr in the Masjid. [Ma`arifus Sunan, page 304, vol.2]

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi) states:
"Imaam Abu Hanifah's (rahmatullahi alaihi) Mazhab (school of thought) was that it is MAKROOH to raise the voice in the Masjid, even if it is for Zikr. Yes, he has given permission for conducting Deeni lessons in the Masjid, if it does not disturb the Musallees, or if no Salaat is taking place in that Masjid (at that time)." [Mirqaat, page 223, vol.2 - Imdadia Multaan print]

WHAT IS MEANT BY THE WORD "MAKROOH" AS IT APPEARS IN A KITAAB

Hadhrat Imaam Abu Yusuf (rahmatullahi alaihi) asked Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi):
"When you say that you understand something to be "Makrooh", what do you mean thereby?" Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi) replied:
"AT-TAHREEM - (i.e. When I says "Makrooh" I mean HARAAM)." [Hidaya, page 172,vol.4]
The author of "Hidaya" states that it has been firmly established from Imaam Muhammed (rahmatullahi alaihi) that he regards "Makrooh" to mean HARAAM.
Imaams Abu Hanifah and Abu Yusuf (rahmatullahi alaihima) said:
"It (Makrooh) is the closest to Haraam." [Hidaya, page 185, vol.4]

Hadhrat Mujaddid Alf-e-Thaani (rahmatullahi alaihi) states:
" That Makrooh which comes in opposition to Mubaah (permissible), it denotes MAKROOH-E-TAHRIMI." [Maktoob, page 29, Daftar Awwal, first part, page 79 - Lahore print]

Those Hanafi Ulama (rahmatullahi alaihim) who have ruled the raising of the voices in the Masaajid as Haraam, have based their rulings on the view of Imaam Abu Hanifa (rahmatullahi alaih), and those who have ruled it as being Makrooh, refer to Makrooh-e-Tahrimi.
It has now become very evidently clear, that according to Imaam Abu Hanifa (rahmatullahi alaih), it is a separate Bid`a to make Zikr loudly, and another Bid`a to make it loudly in the Masjid.

The Masaajid are such places where one gains the recognition of Allaah Ta`ala and one attains the Sunnat of Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam). Its respect and honour is binding upon each and every Muslim. The Aayat of Allaah Ta`ala (in Surah Noor):
"In the 'Buyoot' (Masaajid), Allaah Ta`ala has ordered that they be raised (honoured/ respected)"
bears testimony to this fact. It is a basic requisite for the protection of this Deen, that the Masaajid are protected internally as well as externally. However, sad to say, we note that nowadays the Masaajid are merely specimens of show, pomp and glory.
Hadhrat Abu Huraira (radhiAllaahu anhu) reports that Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said:
"When the Salaat has begun, do not approach it running, come walking (at normal pace). It is necessary that you adopt calmness and tranquillity. Perform those Rakaats which you have attained, and complete those which you have missed." [Abu Dawood, page 84, vo.1].
One of the reasons for the prohibition of running in the Masjid, is that this act is disrespectful to the sanctity of the Masjid, and is therefore undesirable.
Hadhrat Ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) reports that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said:
"The intelligent and mature ones amongst you should stand closest to me, then those after them and then those after them. Save yourselves (in the Masjid) from the noise and bustle of the market places." [Mishkaat, page 98, vol.1].

This narration proves that the Masaajid must be saved from the noise, hustle and bustle of the market places, especially during the times of Jamaat Salaat. Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) has expressly prohibited this. One should understand from this Hadith that to raise the voices in noise at the market places is commendable or acceptable. Some people regard it as being permissible, and worthy of Thawaab, but Islaam has also placed restrictions here. Islaam does not condone any sort of

noise and disturbance.
In Bukhari Shareef, where the qualities of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) are extolled as they appear in the Tawraah, the following is also recorded:
"And (Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam)) does not make noise in the market places." [pages 285 and 717, vol.2].

Hadhrat Imaam Bukhari (rahmatullahi alaih) has recorded this narration in the first instance, under the chapter entitled : "Chapter on the prohibition of making a noise in the market places".
It is evident that Allaah Ta`ala has sent Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) as a perfect example for mankind and as a role model, hence it is imperative that the Ummat follow this example.

Hadhrat Abu Huraira (radhiAllaahu anhu reports that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said:
"Allaah Ta`ala holds every such person in contempt, who has pride, hoards wealth (and is miserly), makes a noise in the market places, lazes like a dead person at night (does not perform Tahajjud Salaat), and works like a donkey during the day. He is well aware of the worldly matters, and oblivious of matters pertaining to the hereafter." [Mawaariduz Zam`aan, page 485].

Some people are expert at worldly matters, but they are completely oblivious and in the dark regarding Deeni and Ukhrawi (hereafter) matters. May Allaah Ta`ala save us from becoming such persons. It is indeed sad to note that these days people have become extremely negligent regarding the sanctity and honour of the Masaajid. Those prophecies of our beloved Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) - mentioned hereunder - have become as glaring as daylight in our present age. They are all being enacted to the letter:

Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiAllaahu anhu) reports that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said:
AThere will come a time, during the final days, that people will speak such things in the Masaajid, which Allaah Ta`ala will have no need for.@ [Mawaariduz Zam`aan, page 99].

The speech referred to in this narration will not have anything to do with Deen, because any such speech, which complies to and has relevance to the Deen, is supposed to be spread from the Masaajid. The Masaajid are the platforms for spreading Deeni matters. This speech (referred to in the narration) is regarding worldly matters. Such things are not lacking in our Masaajid these days.
Imaam Nasar bin Muhammed bin Ebrahim Samarqandi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaih) - passed away 393 A.H.- reports the following:
"Indeed Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) has said: 'Such a time will befall my Ummat when their speech in the Masaajid will be regarding their worldly matters. Allaah Ta`ala will have no need for such speech, hence you should not sit amongst them." [Tanbeehul Ghaafileen, page 112 Misr print].

Hadhrat Anas (radhiAllaahu anhu) reports that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said:
"Such a time will dawn upon my Ummat when they will gather (form groups) in the Masaajid, and they will have worldly motives. Allaah Ta`ala has no need for them, hence do not sit with them." [Mustadrak, page 323, vol.4].

The gathering in the Masaajid for Ta`leem (learning and teaching) purely with worldly motives (earning wealth), Khatam Shareef, Ghiyaarwi, etc., are all included in the above narrations.
Hadhrat Abdullah bin Umar (radhiAllaahu anhu) reports:
"Such a time will befall this Ummat when they will gather in the Masaajid, and they will perform Salaat, but there will not be a single Mu`min amongst them." [Mustadrak, page 442, vol.4].

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaih) reports:
"Imaam Ibn Humaam has clarified that even permissible speech is forbidden in the Masaajid. Such speech devours good deeds. So what about such speech during Tawaaf, when Tawaaf is in the order of Salaat?" [Al-Maslakul Muttaqist, page 110]

Just as Salaat is an act of worship, so too is Tawaaf of the Kaaba, however, necessary speech during Tawaaf is permissible. As it has been reported in a Hadith that Tawaaf is just like Salaat, but speech is allowed therein. [Al-Maslakul Muttaqist, page 111, Misr print].

Allaamah Hussein bin Muhammed Saeed Abdul Ghani Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaih), states in commentary of the above:
"It is stated in 'Zahriyya' that to gather in the Masaajid with worldly motives is not permissible, because the Masaajid have not been built for worldly reasons.. It is stated in 'Jalaabi', under the chapter of Salaat that some permissible worldly talk is allowed in the Masaajid, but it is better for one to engage in some form of Zikr (remembrance of Allaah Ta`ala). The same is reported in 'Tamartaashi Hindiya'.

From this we gather that to sit in the Masjid expressly for worldly motives is forbidden. Yes, if one went to the Masjid for the reason of listening to a lecture or for Ta`leem etc, and one had engaged in some worldly talk 'by the way', then from the text of Tamartaashi - [Imaam Shamsud Deen Muhammed bin Abdullah bin Ahmed Tamartaashi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaih)- passed away 1004 A.H.], there is leeway in accepting such an indulgence. However, this much must also be remembered that this speech must be restricted to necessity. If one spoke without necessity and merely to engage in 'small talk', then this is also forbidden.

Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaih) mentions the following under the Makroohaats of Tawaaf:
"Wasteful / Unnecessary speech (is also Makrooh), except that (speech) which is necessary, then it will be allowed to the extent of its necessity." [Al-Maslakul Mittaqist, page 112, Misr print].

It is mentioned in 'Irshaadus Saari':
"Sheikh Abdullah Afeef (rahmatullahi alaih) has recorded that necessary speech (during Tawaaf) will be acceptable, if the occasion warrants." [page 110].

The above is stated fully in Fataawa Hindiya:
"To gather in the Masaajid for (vain) talk is undoubtedly forbidden, because the Masaajid are not built for worldly purposes. The subject matter which appears in 'Khazaanatul Fiqh' also proves that permissible worldly talk in the Masaajid is Haraam. He has said that one should not speak worldly matters in the Masaajid. It is stated in 'Jalaabi' that permissible worldly talk in the Masaajid is allowed, but it is better to engage oneself in some form of Zikr. The same is reported in 'Tamartaashi'." [Aalimgiri, page 356, Misr print].

One should keep in mind that even those Ulama who have given consent for worldly speech in the Masaajid, have expressly stated that this is only permissible, in time of necessity.

Amongst those Ulama who had more free thinking and views, like Allaamah Ibn Hazam Zaahiri (rahmatullahi alaih) - passed away 456 A.H. - was also constrained to say the following regarding the matter at hand:
"That worldly speech which has no sin in it, is permissible in the Masaajid, although it is more commendable that one engages in Zikr of Allaah Ta`ala." [Muhalla Ibn Hazam, page 241, vol.4].

It is obvious that such sinful talk, like backbiting, making fun of others, hurting the feelings of others, etc.; just as it is forbidden outside the Masjid, all the more it is Haraam inside the Masjid. Yes, such talk which is not sinful, is allowed inside the Masjid, at times of necessity and limited, however it is better to engage in remembrance of Allaah Ta`ala.

It is permissible to raise the voice in the Masjid for Ta`leem (teaching).

It is stated in Mirqaat that Hadhrat Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaih) has given consent to conducting Deeni talk and advices in the Masaajid, on condition that it does not disturb those who are engaged in Salaat.
It is averred from some quarters that, since loud Zikr is not allowed in the Masaajid, then all lectures etc. also be terminated. But, they say, this will not be done because

it would constitute a blow to the Rozi (earnings) of the lecturers.

<u>ANSWER:</u>
The Ulama of the Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat, do not give lectures and lessons in loud voices in the Masaajid, for the reason of earning a living. Allaah Ta`ala has provided numerous avenues for one to earn a living. They raise their voices when giving lectures and advices, because Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) used to give Khutbahs (lectures / advices) in a loud voice in the Masjid. They raise their voices when giving lectures and advices, because Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaih) has consented to it, and those adhering to the Hanafi Mazhab, should follow their Imaam. We follow and accept the view of Imaam Saheb (rahmatullahi alaih) regarding all other rulings and beliefs. Those who raise objections, are free to follow whomsoever they desire.

Hadhrat Abu Huraira (radhiAllaahu anhu) reported that Rasulullah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said that the person who comes to the Masjid, purely for the reason of learning or teaching Ilm, will be like one who strives in Jihaad in the path of Allaah Ta`ala. [Ibn Majah, page 20].

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaih) states in commentary of this Hadith:
"The word Aor" which appears in the Hadith ("...learning or teaching..") is not because of doubt, rather ir denotes diversity. This is clear proof that teaching in the Masjid is permissible. Contrary to that which was previously reported from Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaih), that the voice cannot be raised in the Masaajid even for Ilmi talk. He has probably forbidden such talk , if it causes a disturbance to others. This person (who teaches or learns in the Masjid), is similar in rank to one who strives in Jihaad, because both these (seeking knowledge and Jihaad) are Fardh-e-Kifaayah." [Mirqaat, page 221, vol.2]

From this we gather that to wage Jihaad in normal circumstances is Fardh-e-Kifaayah (when the Muslims are besieged by the Kuffaar, then Jihaad becomes Fardh-e-Ain). Similarly, to seek that (Shar`i) knowledge which is over and above the necessity is Fardh-e-Kifaayah.(to seek that much (Shar`i) knowledge regarding one=s everyday life is Fardh-e-Ain). Hence, both these persons (Mujaahid and Islamic student/teacher) are regarded as being in the path of Allaah Ta`ala. Some Ulama have written and Imaam Nawawi (rahmatullahi alaih) has also stated that Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaih) and other Ulama have stated that to raise the voice in the Masaajid, even for learning and teaching is Makrooh. However, Imaam Abu Hanifa and Imaam Muhammed bin Maslimah Maaliki (rahmatullahi alaihima) have given consent to the raising of the voices in the Masaajid to the reasons of learning, teaching and Ilmi discussions, because people gather in the Masaajid for this reason. [Muhsala Sharah Muslim, page 210, vol.1].

Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaih) has also recorded in numerous places this view of Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaih). In Mirqaat, page 223, vol.2, he states that this ruling of Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaih) is not general, but refers to those instances where it causes a disturbance to others. This interpretation appears to be the most correct, because Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) used to give advices in a loud voice, and it has also been reported that he (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) used to ask the Sahabah (radhiAllaahu anhum) after every Fajr Salaat regarding any dream that they saw. Thereafter, Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) would interpret such dreams. One such incident, wherein Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) relates his own dream appears in a lengthy Hadith in Bukhari Shareef (pages 185 and 1043). It is clear that such episodes could not have taken place except with the raising of the voices. It is obvious that such incidents were not hidden from the likes of Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaih).

AND ALLAAH TA`ALA ALONE KNOWS BEST.

CHAPTER ON FOLLOWING THE SUNNAH, THE PIOUS PREDECESSORS, AND REJECTING BID'AH.

<u>Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) reproaches a group who changed the method of dhikr.</u>

<u>Abu Nu'aim (R. A) reports in Hilya (Vol.4 Pg.381) from Abil Bakhtari (R. A), who says, "Someone informed Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) about a group of people who used to sit in the Masjid after Maghrib. A person from amongst them tells the others, 'Recite Allahu Akbar in such and such a manner. Recite Subhaanallah in such and such a manner. Recite Al Hamdulillaah in such and such a manner.' Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) asked, 'Do they then do as he says?' 'Yes, replied the</u>

person.' Thereupon, Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) told him, 'Inform me when you see them gathering again."

Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) then came to this group, wearing his high hat, and sat with them. When he heard what they were saying, he stood up (he was a stern man). He said, "I am Abdullaah bin Mas'ood. By Allaah, besides Whom there is none worthy of worship! Verily you people have certainly perpetrated a bid'ah most unjustly!" The narrator says that Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) may have added the words, "Are you people superior than the companions of Muhammad (sallallahu-alayhi-wa-sallam) in knowledge?"
Ma 'dad said, "By Allaah! We never intended to perpetrate a bid'ah unjustly, nor are we superior than the companions of Muhammad (sallallahu-alayhi-wa-sallam) in knowledge." Amr bin Utba said, "We seek forgiveness from Allaah."

Thereupon Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) told them, "It is compulsory for you to follow the path. Strictly adhere thereto. By Allah! If you will do so, you will have advanced far ahead. Verily, if you start going left and right, you will stray far off."

The narration of Tabraani records, "The news reached Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) that a group of people were sitting in the Masjid between Maghrib and Isha…" The rest of the narration is like the one above. The only difference is in the following words:

"Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) said to them, "You people have certainly perpetrated a bid'ah most unjustly, otherwise we, the companions of Muhammad (sallallahu-alayhi-wa-sallam), must have strayed." Amr bin Utba bin Farqad said, "We seek forgiveness from Allaah, Oh Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A), and we repent to Him." Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) then ordered them to disperse.

Abul Bakhtari (R. A) also says in the narration of Tabraani, "Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) saw two groups in the Masjid of Kufa. He stood between the two and asked, 'Which of you two was before the other?' When the one group said that they were first, Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) ordered the other group to join them, thereby combining the two into one.
An authentic abridged narration of Tabraani states that Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) approached them covering his face. He said, "Whoever recognises me will have recognised me. As for those who do not recognise me, I am Abdullaah bin Mas'ood. Are you people more rightly guided than the companions of Muhammad (sallallahu-alayhi-wa-sallam)?" The narrator says that Hadhrat Abdullah bin Mas'ood (R.A) also may have added, "You people are definitely clinging to the tail of deviation."
Tabraani has also reported the narration in his Kabeer from Amr Ibn Salma (A.R). he says that they were sitting at the door of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A)'s home between Maghrib and Isha, when Hadhrat Abu Moosa Ash'ari (R.A) came to the house saying, "Come with me, Oh Abu Abdur Rahmaan [Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A)]." When Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) came out from the house, he asked, "Oh Abu Moosa! What brings you here at this hour?" Hadhrat Abu Moosa Ash'ari (R.A) replied, "By Allaah! The only thing that brings me here is something that I have seen, which has frightened me, yet it seems good. There is a group sitting in the Masjid with a person telling them, 'Recite Subhaanallah in such and such a manner. Recite Al Hamdulillaah in such and such a manner."

Hadhrat Amr bin Salma (A.R) says that they accompanied Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood (R.A) to the Masjid. When he arrived there, he told the people, "You have wandered astray so swifly, even while the companions of Muhammad (sallallahu-alayhi-wa-sallam) are still alive in your midst, his wives are still young, and his clothing and utensils have still not changed!(have not gone old) Count your evil actions, for I stand surety onto Allaah that your good actions will be counted."

THE STATEMENT OF HADHRAT ABDULLAAH BIN ZUBAIR (R.A) WHEN HIS SON SAT WITH A GROUP WHO BECAME ECSTATIC AS THEY ENGAGED IN DHIKR.

Abu Nu'aim (R.A) has reported the following narration in Hilya (Vol.3 Pg.167) from Hadhrat Aaamir (R.A.), the son of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Zubair (R.A). He narrates that he once came to his father, who asked him, "Where have you been?" The son replied, "I found a group of people. I have not seen anyone better than them. They engage in dhikr and one of them trembles and grows ecstatic till he falls unconscious due to fear for Allah. I was sitting with them."

Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Zubair (R.A) instructed his son saying,"Never sit with them again!" When he detected that this did not make an impression on his son, he added, "I have seen Rasulullah (sallAllaahu-alayhi-wa-sallam) recite the Qur'aan, and I have seen Hadhrat Abu Bakr (R.A) and Hadhrat Umar (R.A) also reciting the Qur'aan. Nothing like this ever happened to them. Do you think that these people fear Allaah more than Hadhrat Abu Bakr (R.A) and Hadhrat Umar (R.A)?" The son, Hadhrat Aamir (R.A.) says, "I realised that this was as he said, thus I left these people."

[From volume 4, pages 97 and 98 of Hayaatus Sahaba – Published by Daarur Rayyaan, Cairo, 1987]

The following is reported in Shaami, which is an authoritative Hanafi Fiqh Kitaab:
"It is recorded in Fataawa Qaadhi Khaan that to recite Zikr aloud is HARAAM, because Hadhrat Ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu) ejected a group of people from the Musjid as they were reciting La Ilaha Illallahu and Durood aloud. And he (Ibn Mas`ood) remarked : 'I conclude that you are only BID`ATEES.' "

Hadhrat Abdullah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu) said : "I take an oath upon that Being, besides whom, none else is worthy of worship, there is no Surah or Aayat in the Qur`aan Shareef of which I do not know the reason of revelation, that is in which condition and for which occasion it was revealed. And I do not know any person, who is more knowledgeable than I in the Qur`aan Shareef." [Bukhari, page 748, vol.2 / Muslim, page 293, vol.2].
Imaam Nawawi (rahmatullahi alaihi) writes that Hadhrat Abdullah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu) was even more knowledgeable than the four Khalifahs in regard to the Qur`aan Shareef. [Sharah Muslim, page 293, vol.2].

One should remember this, that the basis of Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi)'s Fiqh, is the knowledge and Fiqh of Hadhrat Abdullah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu). His rank was extremely high with regard to Tafseer and Fiqh.

"And remember your Lord (make Zikr) in your heart with humility and fear, without raising your voices." (Surah A`raaf)
"Call out to your Lord with humility and silently. Surely HE does not like the transgressors." (Surah A`raaf)

"Oh people! Have mercy upon yourselves, you are not calling upon that being who is deaf or absent. You are calling upon that being who is All-Hearing and close by(Omnipresent), and HE is with you (all the time)." (Bukhari page 605 vol.2, Muslim page 346, vol.2)

"The Aayat 'And remember your Rabb in your hearts..' is general in so far as Zikr is concerned, in Qiraat, du`aa and others besides these, or it applies to the Muqtadi, that he should make soft Qiraat after the Imaam has completed his Qiraat, as is the Mazhab of Imaam Shaafi (rahmatullahi alaihi)." [Refer Tafseer Baidhawi, pages 342 and373, vol. 1 -Printed by 'Daarul Kutubul Ilmia' - Beirut, Lebanon]

Hadhrat Imaam Abu Hanifah Nu`maan bin Thaabit (rahmatullahi alaihi) {died 150A.H} has proclaimed Loud Zikr as being a Bid`a from this Aayat of the Qur`aan Shareef :
"Call out to your Lord with humility and silently. Surely HE does not like the transgressors." (Surah A`raaf)
Allaama Sheikh Ebrahim Halbi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) {died 956 A.H.} states the following;
"Imaam Abu Hanifah said that our discussion is not regarding normal Zikr, because this is, at all times a preferred and encouraged act. In fact our discussion is regarding loud Zikr, and loud Zikr is Bid`a, because Allah Ta`ala says that we should call unto Him with humility and softly, except on those occasions which the

Shariah has allowed. Hence, regarding those exceptions which have conflicting proofs, we use logical reasoning, and practice upon the original (i.e what has been conclusively proven). This is the precautionary course of action, as here the proofs are conclusive. This much also becomes clear (from this discussion), that there is no basis for those who prefer the opinion of the Saahibain (Imaams Abu Yusuf and Muhammed) (rahmatullahi alaihima) in this matter." [Ghani`atul Mustamli, page 531-2 - printed by 'Rahimia', Deoband].

Haafiz Ibn Humaam Muhammed bin Abdul Waahid Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) {died 861} writes:
"The 'Asl' (actual form) of Zikr is (that it should be) soft. To make it aloud is Bid`a. [Fathul Qadeer, page 430, vol.1 - printed in Egypt].

Allaama Alaa`uddeen Abu Bakr bin Mas`ood Alkaasaani Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) {died 587 A.H.} states: "The 'Asl' in Zikr is softness, except those instances which the Shariah has excluded." [Al-Bada`i wa Sana`i, page 279, vol.1 [printed in Egypt].

Hadhrat Moulana Abdul Hay Lucknowi (rahmatullahi alaihi) {died 1304 A.H.} writes from Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi) regarding the Takbeers of Eid Salaat:
"Imaam Saheb's proof is this that the 'Asl' in Zikr is softness, like Allah Ta`ala has ordered that His remembrance be made in the heart. The reciting of loud Zikr on the occasion of Eidul Adha is proven in the Shariah, hence this (permissibility) is restricted to this." [Umdatur Ri`aaya, page 246, vol.1].

Hadhrat Qaadhi Thanaawullah Paani Patti Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi), states the following in his lengthy Tafseer of this Aayat :
"Hence, there is a consensus of opinion of the Ulama that soft Zikr is preferred, and that loud Zikr is *BID`A,* except those instances where Zikr has been prescribed as being loud. For example, Azaan, Iqaamat, Takbeer-e-Tashreeq, the Takbeers of an Imaam when changing postures in Salaat, if there is a need for the Muqtadis (to correct the Imaam), then they should say Tasbeeh, the Talbiyah of Hajj and other such instances." [Tafseer-e-Mazhari, page 408, vol.3]

The above proves that loud Zikr is BID`A at all times except those occasions which are excluded by the Shariah. In the (above cited) text, the words "Ajma`a" (there is a consensus) is clearly stated, however, mention was not made of those who had reached this consensus. This clarification is given to us by Hadhrat Qaadhi Saheb himself in the same Tafseer :
"The 'Asl' in Zikr is softness, and to make Zikr loudly is BID`A. Since there is a difference of opinion regarding the loudness of Zikr, we opt for the less of the two, and say that soft Zikr is better and preferred. Upon this (that soft Zikr is better), there is a consensus of opinion amongst the Sahabahs (radhiallahu anhum) and the Taabi`een (rahmatullahi alaihim). According to the statement of Hadhrat Hassan Basri (rahmatullahi alaihi): "Soft Du`aa is seventy (70) times superior to loud Du`aa. There is no doubt that Muslims used to make great efforts in their du`aas, and their voices could not be heard. Their du`aas were between them and their Rabb". It is for this reason that Allah Ta`ala says: *"Call unto your Rabb with humility and softly."* Allah Ta`ala mentions the Zikr of a pious servant of His (Hadhrat Zakariyya (alaihi salaam), as being soft. This also proves the preference to soft Zikr. Hadhrat Sa`ad bin Abi Waqqaas (radhiallahu anhu) states that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said : "The best Zikr is (the one that is done) softly, and the best sustenance is that one which is sufficient." [ Reported by Ahmed ibn Hibbaan and Baihaqi in "Sha`abul Imaan"] [Tafseer-e-Mazhari, page 408-9, vol.3]

"Abu Ya`la reports from Hadhrat Aisha (radhiallahu anha), that she said, Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: *"The best Zikr is (that) soft Zikr, which even the Angels of protection (i.e. Kiraam and Kaatibeen) cannot hear, it will be multiplied seventy times, on the day of Qiyaamah."* [Tafseer-e-Mazhari, page 410, vol.3]

Hadhrat Hassan Basri (rahmatullahi alaihi) - {who passed away in 110 A.H.} mentions in the kitaab 'Tazkiratul Huffaaz' on page 67: *"Soft Zikr is seventy (70) times more superior than loud Zikr.".* The Hadith mentioned above also corroborates this.
Regarding the two Aayaat, i.e "*Call out to your Lord with humility and silently. Surely HE does not like the transgressors"*, and *"When he (Hadhrat Zakariyya alaihi salaam) called out softly unto his Rabb"*, the following Tafseers state that these are proof for soft Zikr; Tafseer Khazin, page 241,vol.2 -Misr print - NOTE THAT THIS IS THE SAME TAFSEER REFERRED TO BY HAMIDI, AND HERE THERE IS SUPPORT FOR SOFT ZIKR, NOTE ALSO THAT WE HAVE CITED PAGE AND VOLUME NUMBERS, WHICH HAMIDI HAS NOT DONE - Tafseer Roohul Ma`ani, page 139, vol.8 - Misr print, Tafseer Ibn Katheer, page 221, vol.2, Tafseer Kabeer, page 131, vol.13 - Misr print.
The following is also reported in Tafseer Kabeer: *"Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: 'One silent du`aa is seventy times more superior than one loud du`aa.' , and he (sallallahu alaihi wasallam)also said: ' The best Zikr is (the one that is done) softly, and the best sustenance is that one which is sufficient'."* [page 131, vol.13]

Secondly, a general order (in the Qur`aan Shareef) denotes Wujoob (compulsion).
Hadhrat Sheikh Ahmed Al-Khafi (passed away in 1130 A.H.) Writes :
"An Amr (order) necessitates Wujoob (compulsion), according to most (of the Faqhis)" [Nurul Anwaar, page 31]

Hadhrat Shah Muhammed Ishaq Dehlwi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1262 A.H.), the grandson of Hadhrat Shah Abdul Azeez Muhaddith Dehlwi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1239 A.H.), clarifies this Mas`ala, in question and answer form. He writes:
"*QUESTION 75 - Is loud Zikr permissible or not in the Shariah? Is it a sin? If so, then what type of sin?*
ANSWER - Loud Zikr according to the Hanafi Mazhab is a BID`A, except those instances where the Shariah has allowed it, for example, Azaan etc. In these instances it is not Bid`a to recite it loudly, whereas at other times it is a Bid`a.. It is reported in Fathul Qadeer, "The Asl of Zikr is that it should be silent, and its loud recital is Bid`a." In those instances where the Fuqaha (Islamic Jurists) have stated something as Bid`a, they intend thereby Bid`a Sayyi`a (evil Bid`a). The reason for Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi) 's ruling that loud Zikr is Bid`a, is stated in the commentary of Hidaya, "Ghaayatul Bayaan". It is written: "It is Bid`a to recite Takbeer in a loud voice, because it is stated in the Qur`aan Shareef that you should call unto your Rabb with humility and silently." It is stated in another commentary of Hidaya, "Kifaya" : "It is Bid`a to say Takbeer in a loud voice, except those instances where the Shariah has specified an exception. Imaam Qaadhi Khaan (rahmatullahi alaihi) has explicitly stated in his Fatwa, that to recite Takbeer in a loud voice is Bid`a. The author of "Musaffa" has also followed suit (in giving the same Fatwa). It is stated in Fataawa Allaamia that the Sufia are prevented from raising their voices and from applauding. It is stated in the commentary of "Tuhfa" - i.e. "Bahriyyatul Mughni", that those persons who claim to be Sufis, should be prevented from such actions. It is stated in "Burhaan", which is the commentary of "Mawaahibur Rahman", that to recite Zikr in a loud voice is Bid`a, because this is contrary to the Aayat of Allah Ta`ala; 'And you should remember your Rabb in your hearts, with humility and silently, and be not loud in speech." And Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said that the best Zikr is the silent one. Hence, one should suffice thereupon (loud Zikr) only on such occasions where the Shariah has allowed it. And verily the Zikr on Eid-ul-Adha is meant to be loud. It appears in the treatise of Allaama Muhammed Aabidul Asadi Ansaari (rahmatullahi alaihi) : "Those Ahadith where loud Zikr is established, it was done so for the reason of Taleem (educating the masses). This is established in the writings of Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi), in "Mirqaat", which is the commentary of "Mishkaat". Whoever wishes he may refer to it." [Mi atu Masaa`il, page 94-5-6, printed by Mutafaa`i - Muhammed Hussein Khaan 1383 A.H.]

Regarding the Hadith, where Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) told the Sahabahs during the expedition of Khaibar, that they should lower their voices when making Takbeer, Imaam Muhyu Deen Abu Zakariyya Nawawi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 676 A.H.), states in the commentary:
"This Hadith proves that if there is no need for raising the voice, Zikr should be read softly, because soft Zikr indicates a greater sense of humility and submissiveness. Yes, if there is a need to recite Zikr in a loud voice, then it should be recited loudly, as it is mentioned in the Ahaadith." [Sharah Muslim, page 346, vol.2]

Allaama Badruddeen Mahmood Ibn Ahmed Al-Aini Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 855 A.H.), states in commentary to the Hadith:
"The crux of the matter is that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) regarded as Makrooh, the recital of loud du`aa and Zikr." [Umdatul Qaari, page 244, vol.14 - Misr print]

Allaama Aini has stated the loud recital of du`aa and Zikr as being Makrooh because Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) regarded it as Makrooh, hence he prevented it's loud recital. Since, Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) has regarded the loud recital of du`aa and Zikr as being Makrooh, then why should not the Salf-e-Saaliheen (Pious Predecessors) also regard it such?
Haafiz Abul Fadhl Ahmed bin Ali bin Hajar Asqalaani Shaafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 852 A.H.) states regarding this Hadith:
"Imaam Tibri mentioned that this Hadith proves that to recite Zikr and du`aa in a loud voice is Makrooh. The Sahabah-e-Kiraam (radhiallahu anhum), the Taabi`een (rahmatullahi alaihim) and most of the Salf regarded it such (i.e. Makrooh-e-Tahrimi)."

"Question: Is loud Zikr according to the Hanafi Mazhab permissible or impermissible?
Answer: There is a difference of opinion in the mas`ala regarding loud Zikr in the kitaabs of Hanafi Fiqh. Some regard it as Makrooh, in such occasions where it is not warranted, while others regard it as Jaa`iz (permissible), and this is the preferred option. It would not be beneficial to seek the proof for this as there is a difference of opinion, so now who can draw an opnion from here? However, the proof (for loud Zikr) is this, that Allah Ta`ala says: "Remember your Rabb in your heart, with humility and softly, and do not be loud.." - The words "do not be loud" also refers to loud Zikr, but of the lowest intensity. Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: "Have mercy upon your souls...." " [Fataawa Rashidia, page 54, vol.1 - Delhi print]

The renowned Imaam Abul Hasan Ubaidullah bin Hussein Karghi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 340 A.H.) states: *"The lowest (intensity of) Loud Zikr, is such that one can hear himself.."* [Hidaya, page 98, vol.1]

Imaam Shamsud Deen Qahstani Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 953 A.H.) Explains the lowest pitch of loud Zikr in the following way, that if an Imaam (is reading) then, his lowest pitch would be such that, others besides himself can also hear him. If one is a Munfarid (reading alone), then for the lowest form of loud would be that he can hear himself. Further on he writes:
"If he (Munfarid) has let two other persons hear him, then this is regarded as the highest pitch of loudness, as it is reported in "Khazana" (name of kitaab)"
He also writes:
"However it is reported in "Mabsoot" and "Kirmaani" etc. , that the highest pitch of loudness for the Munfarid is that he hear himself." [Jaami`ur Rumooz, page 74, vol.1]

This Hadith is reported in Bukhari Shareef five (5) times. In one of the narrations it is stated that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) was *departing for or (the narrator has a doubt) he was on his way to Khaibar*, and when they came to a particular field then the Sahabahs raised their voices in Takbeer [page 605, vol.2].
In another narration, the Sahabahs (radhiallahu anhum) mention that they were with Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) accompanying him (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) on a journey, and when they ascended a high plain they recited Takbeer (loudly) [page 944 and 1099, vol.2].
In another narration, it is reported that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) was entering a valley, and another person was also climbing the valley, and he (latter) raised his voice (in Takbeer) [page 948, vol.2].
In another narration it is reported, that we (Sahabahs) were with Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) on a journey, *"Then we began, to recite Takbeer loudly whenever we ascended a high place or descended a low place or into a valley."* [page 978, vol.2]

These narrations clearly indicate that there is prohibition from raising the voice in Takbeer, and loud Zikr. This (prohibition) was not made at Khaibar, in fact it was made on the way to Khaibar. Khaibar is 20 miles away from Madinah Tayyibah [Seeratun Nabi, page 436, vol.1]. There is no record (in the books of History), of any powerful enemy which existed on this road to Khaibar, from which the Muslim army (least of all a Muslim army of 1600 soldiers) needed to be wary of. There was no need for the Muslims to lower their voices out of fear of alerting any enemy on the way to Khaibar. Hence, to use such a flimsy excuse to explain away this Hadith, carries no weight.

Hadhrat Sa`ad bin Abi Waqqas (radhiallahu anhu) reports that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said:
"The best Zikr is that one which is recited softly, and the best sustenance is that one which is sufficient (for one's necessities)." [Masnad Ahmed, page 172, vol.1 / Mawaaridu Dham`aan, page 577 / Baihaqi - as reported in Tafseer Mazhari, page 409, vol.3]

Hadhrat Moulana Rashid Gangohi (rahmatullahi alaihi) answered a question regarding loud Zikr in the Musjid as follows;
"Question: Those Sufis who, after the Maghrib Salaat, gather in groups in the Musjid, and they jump and shout. Is this gathering in the Musjid and reciting of Zikr (loudly), permissible or not? Is it permissible to recite poems etc. with enthusiasm and fervour in the Musjid, permissible or not?
Answer: Some Ulama have stated that raising the voice in the Musjid, even for Zikr, is Makrooh. Not to hold such gatherings in the Musjid is better." [Fataawa Rashidia, page 215-6]

Hadhrat Saa`ib bin Yazid (radhiallahu anhu) says that once he was sitting in Musjid-e-Nabawi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) when someone threw a few pebbles in his direction. When he looked up he saw that it was Hadhrat Umar (radhiallahu anhu), who told him to call a certain two persons to him. When the two were brought in front of him, they were asked from which tribe and family they belonged. (The narrator doubts, and says that they were probably) asked from where they came. They said that they were inhabitants of Taaif. Hadhrat Umar (radhiallahu anhu) told them that if they were from Madinah Tayyibah, then he would have punished them, because:
"You raised your voices in the Musjid of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam)." [Bukhari Shareef, page 67, vol.1]

Hadhrat Abu Huraira (radhiallahu anhu) narrates a Hadith where Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) stated 15 signs of Qiyaamah, and he (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said that they (these signs) will surely transpire. One of these signs are:
"Voices will be raised in the Masaajid." [Mishkaat Shareef, page 470, vol.2 - from Tirmidhi, page 44, vol.2]

Regarding this Hadith, Mullah Ali Qaari Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1014A.H.), made the following commentary:
" Some of our Ulama have clearly stated that to raise the voice in the Musjid is HARAAM, even if it is for Zikr." **[Mirqaat, page 171, vo.1 - Multaan print]**

Allaama Ala`ud Deen Muhammed bin Ali Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1088 A.H.), writes the following under the Adaabs (etiquettes) of the Musjid:
"To ask (for something) in the Musjid is HARAAM, and to give (something) is Makrooh. Similarly, to look for a lost item in the Musjid (is Makrooh). To recite poems in the Musjid is also Makrooh, unless they are for advice. Similarly, to recite loud Zikr in the Musjid is HARAAM, except for those who are seeking Ilm or Fiqh (i.e. for students of Deen, if they are learning in the Musjid)." **[Durrul Mukhtaar with the Sharah Raddul Mukhtaar, page 617, vol.1, Misr print]**

Hadhrat Ma`az bin Jabal (radhiallahu anhu) reported that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: ***"Keep your children and your insane persons away from the Masaajid, also (keep) your buying, selling, quarrels and RAISED VOICES (away from the Masaajid)."*** **[Al-Kabeeri, page 566-7 - Musannif Abdur Razzak, page 442, vol.1 - Beirut print]**

Alaama Sayyid Mahmood Aaloosi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1270 A.H.), mentioned the following regarding loud Zikr:
"You see many persons, from amongst your era, who yell when they make du`aa, especially in gatherings (in the Masaajid), to such an extent that they make them (du`aas) poetic. They holler to such an extent that ears even get clogged. They are (blissfully) unaware that they have perpetrated two (2) Bid`as. One is to raise the voice in du`aa, and the other is to raise the voice in the Musjid." **[Roohul Ma`aani, page 139, vol.8]**
This statement of Alaama Aaloosi (rahmatullahi alaihi) was made about 150 years ago. We assume that during that era there were no loudspeakers, if he had to be present today to see our present situations, Allah Ta`ala knows best what would have been his reaction !

Haafiz Ibn Taymia Hanbali (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 728 A.H.), writes:
"It is forbidden to raise the voice in the Musjid, it is especially worse to do so in Musjid-e-Nabawi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam)." **[Manaasikul Hajj, page 36 - Misr print]**

Generally, Zikr is made loudly in the Masaajid, for name and fame, and to bolster one's own faction (sect), and to degrade persons of other beliefs. Imaam Ebrahim bin Moosa Shaatbi Maaliki (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 790 A.H.), said in complaint of the same:
***"However, to raise the voices in the Masaajid, which is done to highlight altercations in Deen, is a Bid`a.."*** **[ Al-I`tisaam, page 79, vol.2 - Misr print]**

Imaam Haafizud Deen Muhammed bin Muhammed Bazazi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 827 A.H.) Writes:
"It is stated in Fataawa Qaadhi Khaan, that to raise the voice in Zikr in the Musjid is HARAAM. The following incident is authentically reported from Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu), that he heard some people who were gathered in the Musjid reciting Laa Ilaaha Illallahu and Durood Shareef loudly. Hadhrat Abdullah Ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu) went to them and said: 'We did not witness such an act during the time of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam), and I regard you as Bid`atees.' He repeated this again and again until he ejected them from the Musjid." **[Fataawa Bazazia, page 375, vol.3]**

From this we learn that to raise the voice in the Musjid in Zikr or Durood Shareef is BID`A according to Hadhrat Ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu). He ejected a group who were reciting Zikr and Durood loudly in the Musjid and he labelled them Bid`atees. Regarding the high status and rank enjoyed by Hadhrat Abdullah ibn

Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu) over the other Sahabahs in so far as Tafseer, Fiqh and knowledge is concerned, is as clear as daylight. Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) once said: "That thing which Ibn Mas`ood prefers for you, I too prefer the same for you and I am pleased with it." [Mustadrak, page 319, vol.3]
It appears in another narration that Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: "That thing which Ibn Mas`ood prefers for my Ummat, I am pleased with it." (Mustadrak, page 317, vol.3]
Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) also said: "That thing which Abdullah ibn Mas`ood does not approve of, I too disapprove of that thing for you." [Al-Isti`aab, page 359, vol.1]
It is evidently clear how much Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) had placed his trust and confidence in Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu).

Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu) gives the following golden advices, which is recorded in Mishkaat Shareef:
"Hadhrat Abdullah ibn Mas`ood (radhiallahu anhu) said : 'If any of you wish to follow in the footsteps of someone, then you should follow in the footsteps of those pious persons who had already passed away, because there is no guarantee that a living person will not fall into Fitnah. Those persons (who you should follow) are the companions of Nabi (sallallahu alaihi wasallam). They are the best of this Ummat. Their hearts were pure and they were very deep in knowledge. They were extremely forthright. Allah Ta`ala had specially chosen them for the companionship of His Nabi. They were appointed for the establishment of this Deen. You should recognise their virtue and follow in their footsteps. Hold on firmly, upon whatever you have the ability to, from their character and habits, because surely they were guided aright. Narrated by Razeen*"* [Mishkaat, page 32, vol.1]

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) stated in commenting upon this Hadith that *the Sahabahs (radhiallahu anhum) never recited Zikr and Durood Shareef, in loud voices. They also never gathered for this purpose in the Musjid or in their homes.* [Mirqaat, page 214, vol.1]

Moulana Sayyid Muhammed Anwar Shah Kashmeeri (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1352 A.H.) States that *to raise the voice in Zikr in the Musjid is HARAAM.* He states this, by quoting Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi). [Urfush Shazi, page 120]
Moulana Muhammed Yusuf Binori (rahmatullahi alaihi) also clearly mentions the prohibition of raising the voice in Zikr in the Musjid. [Ma`arifus Sunan, page 304, vol.2]

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi) states:
"Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi)'s Mazhab (school of thought) was this that it is MAKROOH to raise the voice in the Musjid, even if it is for Zikr. Yes, he has given permission for conducting Deeni lessons in the Musjid, if it does not disturb the Musallees, or if no Salaat is taking place in that Musjid (at that time)." [Mirqaat, page 223, vol.2 - Imdadia Multaan print]

WHAT IS MEANT BY THE WORD "MAKROOH" AS IT APPEARS IN A KITAAB

Hadhrat Imaam Abu Yusuf (rahmatullahi alaihi) asked Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi):
"When you say that you understand something to be "Makrooh", what do you mean thereby?" Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi) replied:
"AT-TAHREEM - (i.e. When I says "Makrooh" I means HARAAM)." [Hidaya, page 172,vol.4]
The author of "Hidaya" states that it has been firmly established from Imaam Muhammed (rahmatullahi alaihi) that *he regards "Makrooh" to mean HARAAM.*
Imaams Abu Hanifah and Abu Yusuf (rahmatullahi alaihima) said:

"It (Makrooh) is the closest to Haraam." **[Hidaya, page 185, vol.4]**

Hadhrat Mujaddid Alf Thaani (rahmatullahi alaihi) states:
" That Makrooh which comes in opposition to Mubaah (permissible), it denotes MAKROOH-E-TAHRIMI." **[Maktoob, page 29, Daftar Awwal, first part, page 79 - Lahore print]**